Master Classes
Mental Health, 'Race' and Culture

1. Traditions of Mental Health and Illness
What Diversity Means

RACIAL AND CULTURAL ISSUES FINDINGS IN ENGLAND

Black / Ethnic Minorities more often:

Diagnosed as schizophrenic

Compulsorily detained under Mental Health Act

Admitted as 'Offender Patients'

Held by police under S. 136 of Mental Health Act

Transferred to locked wards

Not referred for 'talking therapies'

Ref: Fernando and Keating, (2009) *Mental Health in a Multi-ethnic Society. 2nd edn.*
(London: Routledge).

'RACE'

'RACE'

'ENTITY' BASED ON SELECTED ASPECTS OF PHYSICAL APPEARANCE SUCH AS SKIN COLOUR

ALL (SUPPOSEDLY) 'RACIAL DIFFERENCES' ARE ASSUMED TO BE GENETIC AND UNCHANGING

'RACE-THINKING'

THINKING OF PEOPLE PREDOMINANLTY IN TERMS OF THEIR 'RACE'

'CULTURE' AND 'RACE' ARE OFTEN CONFOUNDED

References

Omi, M. and Winant, H. Racial Formation in the United States From the 1960s to the 1990s (New York and London: Routledge).

Barzun, J. (1965) *Race: A Study of Superstition (*New York and London: Harper and Row).

See Fernando, S. (2010) *Mental Health, Race and Culture* third edition Palgrave-Macmillan, Basingstoke pp. 7-9

'CULTURE' IN THE CONTEXT OF 'MENTAL HEALTH'

***NOT* A CLOSED SYSTEM THAT CAN BE DEFINED CLEARLY**
***NOT* JUST TRADITIONAL VALUES, BELIEFS AND PRACTICES**

Living, dynamic and changing system of values and worldviews that people live by, create and re-create

A system in which people define their identities and negotiate their lives

Systems of knowledge & practice that provide individuals with conceptual tools for self-understanding and rhetorical possibilities for self-preservation and social positioning

References

Kirmayer, L. (2006) 'Culture and Psychotherapy in a Creolizing World', *Transcultural Psychiatry,* 43(2), 163-168

See Fernando, S. (2010) *Mental Health, Race and Culture* **third edition Palgrave-Macmillan, Basingstoke pp. 9-13.**

HISTORICAL CONTEXT OF PSYCHIATRY

Historical Events

1418	Portuguese voyage to West Africa
1492	Columbus reaches America
	Vasco da Gama lands in India
	Plunder of America
	Genocide of Americans
1577	African slaves landed in America
	Triangular trade: England

sugar, cotton — cloth, iron,
tobacco — rum, guns
America — Africa
slaves

1764	British Occupy Bengal
	Plunder of India
1807	Abolition of Slave Trade
1839-42	Defeat of China in Opium Wars
1861	British occupy Lagos
1884	Berlin Conference: Scramble for Africa
	Plunder of Africa
1947	Liberation of India
1957	Liberation of Ghana
1963	Commonwealth Immigrants Act
1971	Immigration Act
1981	British Nationality Act

COLONIALISM

SLAVERY

PSYCHIATRY

Growth of Psychiatry

1403	Bethlem Priory admits lunatics
1546	Bethlem Priory given to laity
1586	'Treatise on Melancholy' (Bright)
1621	'Anatomy of Melancholy' (Burton)
1632	Medical Governor of Bethlem
1713	Hospital for the Insane at Norwich
1734	'The English Malady' (Cheyne)
1744	Vagrancy Act
1774	Private Madhouses Act
1792	The Retreat for the Insane at York
1808	County Asylums Act
1841	Association of Medical Officers of Asylums
1858	'A Manual of Psychological Medicine'
1863	Broadmoor Hospital
1890	Lunacy Act
1930	Mental Treatment Act
1959	Mental Health Act
1963	British Journal of Psychiatry
1971	Royal College of Psychiatrists
1983	Mental Health Act

Ref.: Fernando, S. (1988) *Race and Culture in Psychiatry*. Croom Helm, London. Reprinted as paperback Routledge, London 1989

HISTORY OF MELANCHOLIA AS ILLNESS (=DEPRESSION)

- **Hippocrates (4th Century BC)**
- **Galen (2nd Century BC)**

- **Alï ibn Rabbãn at-Tabarï (d. *c.*240/855)**
- **Ishãq ibn 'Imrãn (d. AD 908)**
- **Ibn Sina / Avicenna (d. AD 1037)**
- **Maimonides (d. AD 1204)**

- **Bright (AD 1586)**
- **Burton (AD 1621)**
- **Tuke (1890 International Classification)**
- **Meyer (1905) suggested 'Depression' instead of 'Melancholia')**

(1920s onwards severe depression seen as part of manic –depression)

(1980s onwards depression subsumed within bipolar disorder)

References
Dols, M. W. (1992) *Majnûn: The Madman in Medieval Islamic Society* (Oxford: Clarendon)
Fernando, S. (2003) *Cultural Diversity, Mental Health and Psychiatry. The struggle against racism* (Hove and New York : Brunner-Routledge)
Meyer, A. (1905) 'A discussion on the classification of the melancholics', *Journal of Nervous and Mental Diseases,* 32, 112-118.
See Fernando, S. (2010) *Mental Health Race and Culture,* third edition, Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan pp..48-51 & 115-116

CROSS-CULTURAL VARIATION OF DEPRESSION

- **PRIMARY DISTURBANCE IS SENSE OF FAILURE OR LOSS EXPERIENCED IN CONTEXT OF DIFFERENTIATION OF 'SELF' vs. 'OTHER'**
  - Loss of group membership ='ISOLATION'
  - Failure towards others = 'SHAME'
  - Failure towards oneself = 'GUILT'
    - (Murphy, 1973)

- **'DEPRESSION' OCCURS IN CULTURES THAT 'PSYCHOLOGIZE' EXPERIENCE**
    - (Marsella, 1978)

- **DEPRESSION IS AN ILLNESS IN CULTURES WHERE 'DEPRESSIVE AFFECTS' ARE FREE- FLOATING AND NOT TIED TO ISSUES OF EXISTENCE / RELIGION**
    - (Obeyesekere, 1985)

TRADITIONS OF WESTERN PSYCHIATRY & PSYCHOLOGY

Many (cultural) traditions exist about 'mind' , health / illness and 'mental health' BUT Western tradition dominates the world politically

(e.g. Watters, E. 2010 – *Crazy Like Us*)

Psychiatry deals with 'abnormal' mind

'Mental illness' and medical therapies

Psychology deals with 'normal' mind

'Scientific psychology'; psychological therapies

'Western' vs 'non-western' / East vs West is a rough division that represents traditions and their origins but not current geographical locations

References

Kleinman, A. (1988) *Rethinking Psychiatry, From Cultural Category to Personal Experience* (New York: Free Press).

Kleinman, A. (1995) *Writing at the Margin. Discourse between Anthropology and Medicine* (Berkeley LA and London: University of California Press).

Watters, E. (2010) *Crazy Like us The Globalization of the Western Mind* (London: Robinson).

See Fernando, S. (2010) *Mental Health, Race and Culture* third edition Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke pp. 29-47.

CULTURE AND 'MIND'

Fernando, S. (2009) 'Meanings and realities' in S. Fernando & F. Keating (eds.) *Mental Health in a multi-ethnic Society*, Brunner-Routledge, London p. 22

	Western tradition	Eastern Tradition
Mind and body	Distinct entities	Indivisible whole
Analysis	Reductionist Mechanistic	Holistic
Tools for study (understanding)	Objective	Subjective
Spirituality	Add-on	Integral

IDEALS OF MENTAL HEALTH

Fernando, S. (2009) 'Meanings and realities' in S. Fernando & F. Keating (eds.) *Mental Health in a multi-ethnic Society*, Brunner-Routledge, London p. 22

Eastern traditions

Integration and Harmony
- between persons
- between families
- within societies
- In relation to spiritual values

Social integration

Balanced functioning

Protection and caring

Western traditions

Self-sufficiency

Personal autonomy

Efficiency

Self esteem

LIBERATION / THERAPY

Fernando, S. (2009) 'Meanings and realities' in S. Fernando & F. Keating (eds.) *Mental Health in a multi-ethnic Society*, Brunner-Routledge, London p 23

EASTERN

ACCEPTANCE OF DEVIATION

HARMONY INSIDE AND OUTSIDE

UNDERSTANDING BY AWARENESS

CONTEMPLATION

BODY-MIND-SPIRIT HOLISM

WESTERN

CONTROL OF DEVIATION

PERSONAL SATISFACTION

UNDERSTANDING BY ANALYSIS

PROBLEM SOLVING

BODY-MIND SEPARATE

CONCEPT OF 'SCHIZOPHRENIA'

CONSTRUCTED IN 1890s – 1920s IN GERMANY (Kraepelin, Bleuler)

Context
OF RACIST IDEOLOGIES (e.g. degeneration – Morel, 1852)
OF CULTURAL BLINDNESS (i.e. observations in Europe only)
Currently: closely involved in perpetuating racist psychiatry

Note
Not validated as representing 'illness'
Unlikely to be useful in non-western cultural contexts
'Schizophrenics' have better outcome in under-developed
    countries in 1970s and 1980s (WHO, 1979; Jablensky et al. 1992)

References and details:
See Fernando, Ndegwa and Wilson (1988) Forensic Psychiatry. Race and Culture. London: Routledge pp. 51-66
See Fernando, S. (2010) *Mental Health Race and Culture*, third edition, Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan pp.. 32-35 & 56-58.
See Fernando, S. (2003) pp. 179-181.

RACISM IN PSYCHIATRY IN THE 19th CENTURY

Race and insanity discourse (Tuke, 1858; Maudsley, 1867; Esquirol (quoted by Jarvis, 1852)

e.g. Slavery conducive to mental health of African-Americans (Anon, 1851)

    Drapetomania – illness of running away among slaves (Cartwright, 1851)

    Racial throwback theory for 'idiocy' (Down, 1866)

Lack of depression among Asians due to immaturity / under-development

    (Kraepelin, 1920, 1921)

'Adolescent races' in textbook on Adolescence (Hall, 1904)

References (and details)
See Fernando, S. (2010) Mental Health, Race and Culture third edition. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan
    pp. 61-67.

RACIST DISCOURSE IN MODERN TIMES

Africans have less depression because they lack 'sense of responsibility' and have minds that resemble those of 'leucotomised Europeans' (Carothers, 1951)

Asians, Africans and African-Americans show less developed 'emotional differentiation' (Leff, 1973, 1977)

Racist IQ movement (Jensen, 1969: Herrnstein & Murray, 1994) supported by Eysenck (1971,1973)

Also note

Diagnosis of 'depression' became commoner in Africans after Ghana became independent - i. e. black people seen as 'responsible' (Prince, 1968)

High rates of schizophrenia diagnosis among Blacks in US, UK, Netherlands (see Fernando, 2003)

References and details

See Fernando, S. (2010) *Mental Health, Race and Culture* **third edition Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan pp. 62-71.**

See Fernando, S. (2003) Cultural Diversity, Mental Health and Psychiatry The struggle against racism. Hove: Brunner-Routledge pp. 99-104

PROBLEMS OF BEING CULTURALLY SENSITIVE

Psychology and psychiatry are socially constructed processes located in a specific cultural tradition, representing particular ideas about the human condition

Aims of therapy are culturally determined

Judgements are influenced by racist assumptions, stereotypes and biases in 'common-sense'

The role of a professional in compulsory detention and in forensic psychiatry is more about social control than about care or therapy